**Diet and Nutrition after the PURE study**

Nikhil Sahdev BSc, Aneil Malhotra PhD MA MSc MRCP (UK),

Sanjay Sharma BSc MD FRCP FESC

Cardiology clinical and academic group. St George’s, University of London

Corresponding author:

Professor Sanjay Sharma

Cardiology Clinical Academic Group

St. George’s University of London

Cranmer Terrace

London SW17 0RE

Telephone: +44(0)208 7255939

Facsimile: +44(0)208 7255908

sasharma@sgul.ac.uk

Word count: 943 (excluding table and references)

1 Table

References 6

D

isclosures**:** None

Dietary modification on a global scale has the potential of reducing cardiovascular disease (CVD) by 50%. There is unequivocal evidence that consumption of industrialised trans unsaturated fats is associated with increased cardiovascular mortality. Despite contrary evidence from short term meta-analyses, saturated fats are also partly condemned as a potential macronutrient enemy for cardiovascular health.1  There is a general consensus among the scientific community that lowering saturated fat is beneficial in reducing the risk of CVD. The 2016 European Society of Cardiology (ESC) guidelines recommend a total fat intake of ≤ 30% of which ≤ 10% should consist of saturated fats. The guidelines also suggest decreasing saturated fat intake by substitution with polyunsaturated fatty acids.2 In June 2017, the American Heart Association’s (AHA) presidential advisory on dietary fats summarised that replacing saturated fat with polyunsaturated vegetable oil reduced CVD by 30%.3 The PREDIMED study, a multicentre randomised controlled trial with 7,447 participants demonstrated that addition of 5 tablespoons of olive oil or 30g unsalted nuts to the conventional Mediterranean diet was associated with a 30% relative reduction in risk of cardiovascular mortality compared with simply lowering saturated fat intake.4 Contrary to the international dietary recommendations for preventing CVD, data from the Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiology (PURE) study has challenged the guidance relating to fat consumption.5

**PURE STUDY**

In the largest epidemiological study of its type, over 135,000 patients were enrolled from 18 different countries (3 high income countries, 5 low income countries and 10 middle income countries) in 5 continents. Patients completed food frequency questionnaires and were followed up for a median of 7.4 years. Outcomes included total mortality and major CVDs (cardiovascular deaths, non-fatal myocardial infarction, stroke and heart failure). During the period of the study there were 4784 cardiovascular events and a total of 5796 deaths. The investigators reported that higher intake of fats, was associated with lower total mortality. There was increasing total mortality benefit as fat consumption increased from 11% (lowest quintile) to 35% (highest quintile) total nutritional intake (HR 0·77 (95% CI 0·67–0·87), p <0·0001). The relative reduction in mortality with fats was maintained irrespective of saturated fat (HR 0·86 (0·76–0·99), p=0·0088, monounsaturated fat HR 0·81 (0·71–0·92), p<0·0001, or polyunsaturated fat intake (HR 0·80 (0·71–0·89), p<0·0001). Indeed, saturated fat intake of <7% was deemed harmful. In contrast, a progressive increase in carbohydrate intake was associated with increased total mortality from lowest quintile to highest quintile (HR 1·28 (95% CI 1·12–1·46;0·0001); specifically, carbohydrate intake exceeding 60% of total energy consumption was associated with increased mortality (Table 1).

**Potential implication and explanations**

Most studies assessing the dietary impact on CVD are conducted in North America and Europe where the percentage of saturated fat intake is higher than the rest of the world. Over the past couple of decades, however, there has been an exponential rise in CVD in low income countries where the impact of dietary intake has not been explored in detail. The major strengths of the PURE study are its sheer size and global representation, providing an incredible resource to inform future nutritional recommendations. Pooled data from 18 countries of which 15 were low or middle income reveals that high carbohydrate rather than fat intake (barring trans unsaturated fats) is the dietary enemy!

Theoretically, replacement of fat with carbohydrates may increase triglyceride concentrations, reduce high density lipoprotein and create smaller apoproteins thereby increasing the risk of heart disease. In the PURE study however, neither an increased carbohydrate intake nor increasing fat intake was associated with an impact on major cardiovascular disease or cardiovascular mortality. Indeed, most deaths were from non-cardiovascular diseases. Replacement of 5% isocaloric carbohydrates with polyunsaturated fats had no impact of CVD mortality but improved non CVD mortality by 16%. Although replacement of carbohydrates with saturated fat reduced risk of stroke by 20%, there was no effect on CVD mortality. Therefore, another possible explanation for reduced mortality with higher fat levels could be the replacement of micronutrients from fat and meat that are essential for general well-being and, possibly protective against infectious diseases or malignancy. Given that the diet from participants from low-income countries mainly consisted of high (and mainly refined) carbohydrates it is also possible that a diet that was low in fat was a proxy for poverty and its own complications.

**Limitations**

As with all nutritional studies, the main source of patient dietary information was from questionnaires and hence recall bias cannot be excluded. In addition, when reporting carbohydrates in dietary questionnaire, the researchers would not have been able to accurately differentiate between refined carbohydrates and whole grain carbohydrates. As with all observational studies, there is concern regarding confounding factors in the PURE study, in particular income, education, culture and conscientiousness, which may all contribute to adverse outcomes. It is arguable that with attentive multivariable adjustment some of these potential confounders may have been accounted for however, the scope for confounding variables in a trial of this magnitude and diversity cannot be underestimated.

**Conclusion**

The PURE study provides an interesting and thought-provoking view on the impact of macronutrients on total mortality. Whether the study calls for a radical change in the current ESC recommendations is debatable. The PURE diet supports previous observations that mortality is increased when saturated fat is replaced with refined carbohydrates as was probably the case in low income countries. Consistent with current recommendations, the study also reveals that the mortality benefit is greatest when refined carbohydrates are replaced largely by polyunsaturated fat.6

With respect to relaxing the current recommendations for saturated fat intake, the scientific community should be encouraged to explore more precise reasons for the findings of the study before changing current, well considered, recommendations.

**References**

1. de Souza RJ, Mente A, Maroleanu A, Cozma AI, Ha V, Kishibe T, Uleryk E, Budylowski P, Schunemann H, Beyene J, Anand SS. Intake of saturated and trans unsaturated fatty acids and risk of all cause mortality, cardiovascular disease, and type 2 diabetes: systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies. BMJ 2015;351:h3978.

1. Piepoli MF, Hoes AW, Agewall S, Albus C, Brotons C, Catapano AL, Cooney MT, Corra U, Cosyns B, Deaton C, Graham I, Hall MS, Hobbs FDR, Lochen ML, Lollgen H, Marques-Vidal P, Perk J, Prescott E, Redon J, Richter DJ, Sattar N, Smulders Y, Tiberi M, van der Worp HB, van Dis I, Verschuren WMM, Binno S, ESC Scientific Document Group. 2016 European Guidelines on cardiovascular disease prevention in clinical practice: The Sixth Joint Task Force of the European Society of Cardiology and Other Societies on Cardiovascular Disease Prevention in Clinical Practice (constituted by representatives of 10 societies and by invited experts) Developed with the special contribution of the European Association for Cardiovascular Prevention & Rehabilitation (EACPR). Eur Heart J 2016;37:2315-2381.
2. Sacks FM, Lichtenstein AH, Wu JHY, Appel LJ, Creager MA, Kris-Etherton PM, Miller M, Rimm EB, Rudel LL, Robinson JG, Stone NJ, Van Horn LV, American Heart Association. Dietary Fats and Cardiovascular Disease: A Presidential Advisory From the American Heart Association. Circulation 2017;136:e1-e23.
3. Estruch R, Ros E, Salas-Salvado J, Covas MI, Corella D, Aros F, Gomez-Gracia E, Ruiz-Gutierrez V, Fiol M, Lapetra J, Lamuela-Raventos RM, Serra-Majem L, Pinto X, Basora J, Munoz MA, Sorli JV, Martinez JA, Martinez-Gonzalez MA, PREDIMED Study Investigators. Primary prevention of cardiovascular disease with a Mediterranean diet. N Engl J Med 2013;368:1279-1290.
4. Dehghan M, Mente A, Zhang X, Swaminathan S, Li W, Mohan V, Iqbal R, Kumar R, Wentzel-Viljoen E, Rosengren A, Amma LI, Avezum A, Chifamba J, Diaz R, Khatib R, Lear S, Lopez-Jaramillo P, Liu X, Gupta R, Mohammadifard N, Gao N, Oguz A, Ramli AS, Seron P, Sun Y, Szuba A, Tsolekile L, Wielgosz A, Yusuf R, Hussein Yusufali A, Teo KK, Rangarajan S, Dagenais G, Bangdiwala SI, Islam S, Anand SS, Yusuf S, Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiology (PURE) study investigators. Associations of fats and carbohydrate intake with cardiovascular disease and mortality in 18 countries from five continents (PURE): a prospective cohort study. Lancet 2017;390:2050-2062.
5. Li Y, Hruby A, Bernstein AM, Ley SH, Wang DD, Chiuve SE, Sampson L, Rexrode KM, Rimm EB, Willett WC, Hu FB. Saturated Fats Compared With Unsaturated Fats and Sources of Carbohydrates in Relation to Risk of Coronary Heart Disease: A Prospective Cohort Study. J Am Coll Cardiol 2015;66:1538-1548.

Table 1

|  |
| --- |
| **Main findings from the PURE study** |
| * Higher intake of fat (saturated and unsaturated) is associated with a lower risk of mortality. |
| * Higher carbohydrate intake (> 60% of diet) is associated with a higher risk of mortality. |
| * No association between total fat or types of fat and cardiovascular mortality. |
| * Current guidelines restricting total fat to < 30% or saturated fat to < 10% total fat are NOT SUPPORTED by this study. |